

University of Southern Queensland



The working relationship between horse and rider during training and competition for  
equestrian sports

A dissertation submitted by

Donald J. Bridgeman

Department of Psychology

For the award of

Doctor of Philosophy

2009

*Certification of Dissertation*

I certify that the ideas, experimental work, results, analyses and conclusions reported in this dissertation are entirely my own effort, except where otherwise acknowledged. I also certify that the work is original and has not been previously submitted for any other award, except where otherwise acknowledged.

Signature of Candidate

Date

Endorsement

Signature of supervisor

Date

*The Horse*

Where in this wide world can man find nobility without pride,  
Friendship without envy, or beauty without vanity.  
Here, where grace is served with muscle and strength by gentleness confined  
He serves without servility; he has fought without enmity.  
There is nothing so powerful, nothing less violent.  
There is nothing so quick, nothing more patient.  
Our past has been borne on his back.  
All our history is in his industry.  
We are his heirs, he our inheritance.

Duncun (1954)

*Publications*

**Bridgeman, D. J., & Pretty, G. M. (2005).** *Exploring heart rate as an indicator of synchronisation between dressage horse and rider at training and competition.*

Paper presented at the ISSP 11th World Congress of Sport Psychology,  
Sydney, Australia.

Pretty, G. M., & **Bridgeman, D. J.** (2005). Of two minds: Consulting with the horse-and-rider team in dressage, showjumping and polo. In J. Dosil (Ed.), *The Sport Psychologist's Handbook* (pp. 569 - 585). Chichester, West Sussex: John Wiley.

**Bridgeman, D. J., Pretty, G. M. & Tribe. A. (2006).** *Heart rate synchronisation of dressage horse and rider during the warm up period for a competition dressage test.* Paper presented at the Australian Equine Science Symposium, Surfers Paradise, Australia.

### *Abstract*

The working relationship between horses and riders is a unique association requiring cooperation between both to achieve the goals of humans in their selected equestrian sport. This dissertation chose the equestrian sports of eventing and dressage to investigate this working relationship between horse and rider, and its stability across training and competition settings. Consideration was given to psychological, physiological and behavioural factors for the human and horse. The research required the development of a measure to indicate the harmony of the working relationship, which resulted in a rider and observer inventory, and of a physiological indicator of the relationship which became the correlation between the horse and rider heart rate and was called heart rate synchronisation. To examine reactive behavioural factors of the horse a horse Behaviour Check List was created, and to consider possible psychological factors implicated in this behaviour a Horse Temperament Inventory was developed. Anxiety was the psychological factor chosen to assess the rider, and the Competitive State Anxiety Inventory – 2 and the Emotion and Mood Components of Anxiety – Questionnaire were used as its different components.

It was hypothesized that there would be significant environmental differences between most factors with the competition environment showing evidence of lower working relationship scores, higher heart rates, higher rider anxiety, and more reactive horse behaviours. Horse temperament was considered to be a trait and therefore no differences were predicted. Negative relationships were hypothesized between the working relationship measures and rider anxiety components, horse temperament and critical horse behaviours. A positive relationship was hypothesized between rider self confidence and the working relationship. Negative relationships were also predicted between rider anxiety, horse temperament and horse behaviour. No specific predictions

were made regarding relationships between rider and horse heart rates and the other factors.

In Study 1 with five eventing teams, results from Cohen's *d* analyses of differences between means supported some hypotheses. A moderate to large effect size was found for rider's somatic anxiety and heart rate being higher in the competition environment, but no significant effects were found for the rider's cognitive anxiety and levels of self-confidence across environments. However, contrary to hypotheses, working relationship and the heart rate synchronisation factors had higher scores in the competition environment and showed a small and large effect size respectively. The horse's temperament was also more positive in the competition environment, with the Horse Temperament Inventory – Rider (HTI-R) revealing a small effect size and the Horse Temperament Inventory – Observer (HTI-O) without the rider a large effect size, suggesting that it seems to be identifying a psychological state of the horse rather than the hypothesized temperament traits. The hypothesis regarding the horse and rider's heart rate was also accepted as they also increased in the competition environment. The horse's maximum heart rate and minimum heart rate showed a moderate effect size and a large effect size was found in the differences of the horse's mean heart rate. The rider's maximum heart rate and mean heart rate data also showed a large effect size and the rider's minimum heart rate means showed a moderate effect size. Due to unforeseen circumstances and the low number of participants, the hypotheses could not be evaluated using inferential statistics. However, the patterns of the findings led to some modifications of methods and the selection of another equestrian sport for Study 2.

The findings from Study 2 with thirty dressage teams indicate the working relationship between horse and rider was stable across environments during a dressage test. The heart rate synchronisation analysis was able to identify significant

relationships between most horse and rider teams during a dressage test in both the training and competition environments. At a group level the correlation between the horse and rider heart rates displayed a significant positive relationship in the training environment, but not in the competition environment. A t-test analysis found stability of the horse's temperament across environments, suggesting that the Horse Temperament Inventory is measuring temperament traits. Also the rider's somatic anxiety showed a significant increase in the competition environment, which was also reflected in the rider's emotional experience of this anxiety. Unexpectedly the rider's self-confidence was also significantly higher in the competition environment. However, no predicted associations were found between working relationship scores and heart rate synchronisation, or between these measures and horse and rider factors.

The relationship between reactive horse misbehaviours and rider anxiety, and the team's working relationship was analysed. A significant association was found between each of the rider's and judge's ratings of the working relationship and heart rate synchronisation with the horse's misbehaviour scores in the competition environment. The rider's somatic anxiety also showed a significant association with the horse's misbehaviour in both the training and competition environments. Significant relationships were also found between horse misbehaviour and performance in both training and competition environments. To extend this investigation further a discriminant function analysis was conducted to determine if the riders with levels of high and low cognitive and somatic anxiety could be categorised on the basis of horse temperament. It revealed that riders with high and low levels of somatic anxiety could be categorised on the basis of the horse's temperament score, whereas riders with high and low levels of cognitive anxiety could be classified on the basis of the horse's heart rate means in the competition environment.

Overall, the dissertation has significant methodological, conceptual and practical outcomes. It demonstrates possible self report, observational and physiological indicators to assess the horse-rider working relationship, and a reliable measure of horse temperament. It also addresses several speculations, assumptions and anecdotal references in the literature about the interactive association between horse and rider. Findings here point to significant associations between horse and rider psychology and physiology, and patterns of relationships that may indicate some relevance to the working relationship, and ultimately performance.



## *Contents*

Certification of Dissertation .....	i
The Horse .....	ii
Publications .....	iii
Abstract .....	iv
Contents.....	viii
List of tables .....	xiv
List of figures .....	xvii
Preface.....	xviii
Acknowledgements .....	xx
Introduction .....	1
The rationale and overview of the dissertation .....	1
Dissertation Objectives .....	4
Dissertation organisation .....	5
Chapter 1.    Exploring horse and rider factors and interactions, and implications for the equestrian team's working relationship: A literature review .....	7
1.1 A brief history of horse-human relationships.....	7
1.2 Factors implicit in the equestrian working relationship .....	9
1.3 Temperament of the equine team member ( <i>Equus caballus</i> ) .....	16
1.3.1 Methodological issues in assessing horse temperament .....	20
1.4 Anxiety of the human team member .....	28
1.4.1 Anxiety in sport .....	29
1.4.2 State anxiety in equestrian sport .....	32
1.4.3 Distinctions between the emotion and mood experience of anxiety.....	39
1.5 Heart rates in the equestrian team .....	44

1.5.1 Horse heart rate .....	46
1.5.2 Rider heart rate.....	49
1.6 Developing a measure of the equestrian working relationship .....	52
1.7 Summary .....	54
Chapter 2. The working relationship between horse and rider during the cross- country phase of eventing .....	56
Abstract .....	56
2.1 Introduction .....	57
2.2.1 Objectives and hypotheses .....	61
2.3 Methods.....	62
2.3.1 Participants and research sites .....	62
2.3.2 Measures .....	64
2.3.3 Procedure .....	74
2.4 Results .....	77
2.4.1 Data preparation and analysis procedures.....	77
2.4.2 Analysis of the measures .....	78
2.4.3 The environmental impact on the horse-rider relationship .....	79
2.4.4 Psychological and physiological assessment of the rider .....	79
2.4.5 Psychological and physiological assessment of the horse .....	81
2.5 Discussion .....	84
2.5.1 Environmental influences on the working relationship between horse and rider .....	85
2.5.2 Environmental influences on the individual horse-rider factors considered to be implicated in the relationship. ....	87
2.5.3 Methodological considerations .....	91

2.5.4 Preview of the next study.....	96
Chapter 3. The working relationship between the dressage horse and rider during training and competition .....	98
Abstract .....	98
3.1 Introduction.....	99
3.1.1 Hypotheses.....	104
3.2 Methods.....	105
3.2.1 Participants and Research Sites .....	105
3.2.2 Measures .....	106
3.2.3 Procedure .....	111
3.3 Results.....	114
3.3.1 Preparation and descriptive analysis of data.....	114
3.3.2 Riders' perception of competition .....	117
3.3.3 The working relationship between horse and rider.....	118
3.3.4 The rider psychological factors.....	122
3.3.5 Rider heart rate.....	125
3.3.6 The relationship between the rider's cognitive and somatic anxiety and heart rate .....	126
3.3.7 Assessment of the horse in the training and competition environments.....	127
3.3.8 Relationships between horse and rider psychological factors, and working relationship indicators.....	127
3.3.9 Post hoc consideration of the CSAI-2 subscales comparing dressage and showjumping riders at competition.....	129
3.4 Discussion .....	129

3.4.1 The working relationship and heart rate synchronisation between horse and rider .....	130
3.4.2 Horse and rider factors related to the working relationship.....	132
3.4.3 Stability of the working relationship and individual factors.....	133
3.4.4 Methodological considerations .....	138
3.5 Summary and Conclusions.....	142
Chapter 4. A closer look at horse behaviour and its relationship to rider anxiety and their working relationship .....	144
Abstract .....	144
4.1 Introduction .....	145
4.1.1 Hypotheses.....	148
4.2 Method .....	149
4.2.1 Participants and research sites .....	149
4.2.2 Measures .....	149
4.2.3 Procedures.....	150
4.3 Results.....	151
4.3.1 Environmental impact on horse behaviour .....	151
4.3.2 Horse behaviour and temperament, and rider anxiety and association with the working relationship and heart rate synchronisation .....	151
4.3.3 A discriminant analysis of riders with high and low anxiety on the basis of horse characteristics.....	154
4.4 Discussion and Conclusion .....	158
Chapter 5. General discussion and conclusion .....	163
5.1 The working relationship between horse and rider .....	163
5.2 Horse and rider factors and their association with the working relationship ....	166

5.3 Methodological considerations and limitations .....	173
5.4 Future research directions .....	175
5.5 Conclusion.....	177
References .....	178
Appendix A .....	201
Eventing research training questionnaire.....	201
Appendix B .....	207
Eventing research competition questionnaire .....	207
Appendix C .....	214
Eventing research training questionnaire.....	214
Appendix D .....	221
Eventing research competition questionnaire .....	221
Appendix E.....	228
Animal ethics approval letter .....	228
Appendix F .....	229
Human ethics approval letter .....	229
Appendix G .....	230
Consent form to participate in the eventing research .....	230
Appendix H .....	232
Extra tables for for Study 1 .....	232
Appendix I.....	238
Dressage research Training Questionnaire .....	238
Appendix J .....	244
Dressage research competition questionnaire.....	244
Appendix K .....	251

Consent form to participate in the Dressage Research .....	251
Appendix L.....	253
Letter of approval from Dressage Queensland to use heart rate monitors.....	253
Appendix M .....	255
Extra Tables for study 2.....	255

*List of tables*

Table 1.1: Summary of research into horses' temperament and/or specific dimensions presented in chronological order.....	21
Table 2.1: The demographic information and competition data summary of riders and horses .....	63
Table 2.2: The WRI-R scores and HRS means, $\sigma$ standard deviations and Cohen's $d$ .	79
Table 2.3: Means, $\sigma$ standard deviations, and effect sizes, for the rider CSAI-2, CSAI-2R, EMCA-Q, and heart rate. ....	81
Table 2.4: Means, standard deviations, and effect size across training and competition environments for horse temperament and heart rate scores.....	82
Table 2.5: A comparison of the horse behaviours without rider in training and competition .....	83
Table 2.6: A comparison of the horse behaviours with the rider in training and competition .....	84
Table 3.1: Descriptive statistics of participants' characteristics.....	106
Table 3.2: Summary of the Cronbach alpha statistics for the psychological measures for the rider, the horse, and the working relationship rating measures .....	108
Table 3.3: Means and standard deviations of all variables. ....	116
Table 3.4: Pearson correlation coefficients indicating the heart rate synchronisation of each horse and rider team during dressage tests in training and competition environments.....	121
Table 3.5: The Pearson correlation coefficients for the WRI-R, WRI-J and the HRS in the training (T) and competition (C) environments .....	122
Table 3.6: MANOVA results of the rider CASI-2 subscales scores in the training and competition environments.....	123

Table 3.7: Means and standard deviations and MANOVA results of CSAI-2R subscales .....	124
Table 3.8: Means and standard deviations and MANOVA results of EMCA-Q subscales .....	125
Table 3.9: The t statistics for rider heart rates during the dressage tests .....	125
Table 3.10: Pearson coefficients between the riders' cognitive and somatic anxiety, their heart rate mean and their heart rate entering the arena at A during a dressage test in the training and competition environments .....	126
Table 3.11: Shows the Pearson correlation coefficients between rider anxiety variables and heart rate synchronisation in the training (T) and competition environments (C). 128	
Table 4.1: The Pearson coefficients of horse misbehaviour and tail position with the horse, working relationship and performance variables at training .....	152
Table 4.2: The Pearson coefficients of horse misbehaviour and tail position with the horse, working relationship and performance variables at competition .....	153
Table 4.3: Summary of the regression analysis predicting rider competition somatic anxiety .....	154
Table 4.4: Means and standard deviations of variables for rider's somatic anxiety groups and the tests of equality of means for a discriminant analysis .....	155
Table 4.5: The results of discriminant function analysis of somatic anxiety of riders	156
Table 4.6 Means and standard deviations of variables for riders' cognitive anxiety groups and the tests of equality of means for a discriminant analysis .....	157
Table 4.7 The results of discriminant function analysis of riders with low and high cognitive anxiety .....	158
Table A.1: The working relationship scores and heart rate synchronisation values for each eventing team .....	232



Table A.2: Anxiety and heart rate variables for riders.....	233
Table A4: Behaviours of horses.....	235
Table A.5: The skewness and kurtosis for all dependent variables .....	255
Table A.6: A Pearson correlation of the synchronicity of Heart rate for horse and rider for each 5 second interval during the dressage. ....	256

*List of figures*

Figure 2.1: Polar S610 coded receiver .....	71
Figure 2.2: Polar T61 coded transmitter .....	71
Figure 2.3 Polar T52H coded heart rate transmitter .....	74

## *Preface*

A life amongst horses drives a desire to comprehend how we have this extraordinary working relationship with nature's most noble creature.

Horsemanship skills have been passed traditionally by word of mouth from one horse trainer to the next. Thus, a lot of knowledge and skill has been lost with the passing of these horsemen as little documentation exists of their expertise. Indeed, much of the literature that does exist regarding the working relationship between horse and rider is derived from a few anecdotal sources. These originate from historical accounts which also reflect superstition and cultural traditions of horsemen from around the world. These horsemen used many different training strategies and techniques which are based on as many varied philosophies. The horse-rider partnership is considered to be very emotive, and conjecture regarding this working relationship is that it is within the domain of a sacred attachment (Keaveney, 2008).

To a person who regularly trains horses this absence of evidence-based understanding of the equine-human working relationship is frustrating. Equestrian sport demands horse and rider work together to succeed. Thus, the evaluation and understanding of both horse and rider behaviour as it occurs interactively is required to determine factors that promote good teamwork and performance during competition.

To consider both horse and rider factors in the one study requires the researcher to cross the boundaries of several scientific disciplines; animal behaviour, comparative psychology, human and animal physiology, and sport and exercise psychology. There are many challenges in integrating terminologies, conceptual frameworks and methodological traditions of such diverse fields, which often disagree with each other. For example, in reviewing the literature for animal behaviour, some researchers examine and describe animal behaviour without attribution of complex

cognitive, emotive or social processes (Tribe, 1998). However, there is another perspective taken by other researchers who consider animal behaviour to be associated with cognitive and emotional processes such as problem solving, attitudes and mood (Fraser & Broom, 1990).

The literature and research informing this dissertation and reviewed in Chapter One integrates both perspectives. The author does not set out to critique or take a position on these two perspectives as part of the rationale for the dissertation or its design.

This dissertation draws together theories and methods that span the scientific disciplines of horse and human behaviour, physiology and psychology. It is recognised that each discipline has different traditions in its organisation and presentation of literature reviews, methods data, and findings. This dissertation was developed and supervised within a Department of Psychology, and hence the tradition in which it is written is within the discipline of psychology and complies with the American Psychology Association (APA 5<sup>th</sup> edition) format.

### *Acknowledgements*

The work reported in this dissertation was carried out between January 2001 and January 2005. To attain the successful completion of this study required the cooperation of a number of people; to them I am deeply indebted.

I gratefully acknowledge and thank my principal supervisor Professor Grace Pretty whose untiring support, advice and assistance throughout this project, made it possible to complete such a unique doctoral dissertation. I also acknowledge and thank my secondary supervisor Dr Andrew Tribe for his valued time and advice during the course of this dissertation.

I gratefully thank Claire Hanney for her tireless assistance and patience through the long hours of data collection at the many eventing and dressage competitions we attended.

I acknowledge and give my thanks to the eventing and dressage riders throughout Southeast Queensland who willingly gave up their valued time and allowed me into their competitive sporting domain to be part of my investigations.

Also thanks to the many academic staff and technical staff in the department of Psychology at The University of Southern Queensland for their assistance, cooperation and support when required.